

# **Municipal Technical Advi**

CITY OF CHATTANOOGA

PARK MAINTENANCE DEPARTMENT REPORT

1995

#### INTRODUCTION

This report is in response to a request by the Park Maintenance Department to conduct a "comprehensive" management and operational review of park maintenance operations. The study was conducted by Mr. Joseph Muscatello, Municipal Management Consultant and Mr. M. Michael Tallent, Senior Management Consultant with the Municipal Technical Advisory Service.

The study and this report have not followed the initial study proposal as agreed to by MTAS and departmental management. The initial proposal involved a more in-depth and broader review than MTAS has been able to provide. In fact, the request may have been more in-depth and broader than any outside consultants could provide unless they actually lived within the department for a lengthy time. In lieu of this approach, the MTAS management and operational review has utilized the Park Maintenance Department personnel to identify issues that need to be addressed and to offer recommendations. These issues were identified by the staff and management of the Parks and Recreation Division through a series of sessions as discussed in the methodology.

In many instances, the people that identified the issues also offered sound recommendations for dealing with those issues and in those cases where staff did not offer a recommendation, MTAS consultants have provided a recommendation. These issues and their recommendations were derived from four major discussion sessions with staff and management. Each session attempted to (1) identify services or functions provided by the department or the individual employee, (2) apply a letter grade (A,B,C,D or F) to each of those services, (3) identify issues and offer recommendations and (4) list the top three actions staff would take if they were made superintendent and did not have any financial, organizational or political constraints in implementing their actions. The results of each of those sessions are contained in the Appendix.

#### METHODOLOGY

The basis of this report came from the input of the employees, the user group, (recreation), and the supervisory staff. Each of these groups provided literally hundreds of ideas on how to improve the services offered by the Parks Division. A number of four-hour sessions were held over a two-month period in order to give every employee the opportunity to provide his/her ideas. Most of these ideas were presented in a very positive manner. There was surprisingly little "griping" about existing situations. Each group is complimented on its positive approach to this effort.

In order to garner input, the employees were divided into groups of 7 to 10 members. Each group was led by an MTAS facilitator. The mission of each group was to provide input for three questions. The guestions were:

- 1. What services do the Parks Maintenance Department provide?
- 2. How would you rate the services provided? If the service is rated low, what is needed to improve the rating?
- 3. What are the first three things that you would do if you were the Parks Superintendent?

The first question, "What services do the Park Maintenance Department provide?", offered an opportunity for the employees to understand the inner workings of the total department and to help them recognize the large number of constituents they serve. Each group was able to provide a substantial list of services provided.

The second question, a two part question, "How would you rate the services provided?", and "What is needed to improve the rating?", gave the employees a chance to discuss each service and to evaluate how they thought they were doing. They were asked to grade each service, "A" for excellent to "F" for failure. The employees gave very forthright suggestions and were "strict" graders of their services. If a service received a grade of C or below, the facilitators asked for employee suggestions on how to improve the service so that it might receive a higher grade.

The third question, "What are the first three things you would do if you were the Parks Superintendent?", provided the employees with an opportunity to set priorities. Again, most employees gave constructive suggestions.

Each of the three major groups, (1) the employees, (2) the recreation supervisors, and (3) the parks supervisors, completed

this format of the three questions. The input received was voluminous. Many of the ideas provided by the three groups overlapped or were very similar. MTAS organized the numerous ideas into categories to help refine the document.

After each of the three groups completed their sections, MTAS met with the Parks and Recreation administrators. Following the basic format used with the employees, MTAS facilitators guided the administrative staff through the series of the three questions. The administrative staff did not have the opportunity to review what the employees had provided in earlier sessions. The comments of the administrative staff are not included in this document.

After meeting with each of the groups and reviewing the suggestions and ideas provided from the three questions, MTAS organized the information and generated the following report which combined many of the ideas into common issues and/or themes. The recommendations offered are provided by MTAS. The report is organized into sections including: (1) Organization Issues, (2) Training Issues, (3) Financial Issues, (4) Management Operational Issues and, (5) Risk Management Issues. A listing of answers from the question, "Three things I would do if I were superintendent?", is also provided.

Although the approach to this report, through the use of employee input, took a great amount of time and effort, the results prove it to have been a worthwhile exercise. The ideas generated by the employees are invaluable. The fact that they had the opportunity to discuss and evaluate the services they offer should provide beneficial results in the years to come. The buy-in received from this exercise should provide the administration greater support when new initiatives are introduced and policies are changed.

MTAS thanks every employee of the Parks Division for their cooperative spirit in the generation of this report.

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

As stated in the methodology, the issues were divided into five major groupings. This summary will attempt to address the major themes of each issue group. In order for many of these issues to be adequately resolved and the recommendations to them implemented, additional on-site data collection activity and analysis must take place. The current staffing within the department is not adequate to provide this data collection and analysis. Everyone is already performing one or more functions and also might lack the skills to do this type of work. Therefore, the first recommendation of this report is the creation of two (2) budget analysts positions for the Parks and Recreation Department. They would have the responsibility of investigating, collecting data and analyzing all possible implementation alternatives of each recommendation. These two positions should eventually work themselves out of a job and at such time would be transferred to the Finance Department for assignment to other areas of the city. Budget analysts positions should be an integral part of the workforce in a city the size of Chattanooga.

Having observed the Greensboro, North Carolina operations and compared them to Chattanooga, we gained an appreciation for centralization of operations and the enhancement it provides management. We were so impressed with Greensboro's operation that we recommend Chattanooga seek that same level of centralization for the Parks Maintenance Department. The superintendent of that department has a lot more in common with his maintenance staff than he has with the recreation staff. The superintendent also has a greater need to know where his people are, when they left the "yard" and when they are returning. The bottom line is that he needs to be intimately involved in the day-to-day operations of his department and that is difficult to do with the current facilities arrangement.

# ORGANIZATION ISSUES

Under the organization grouping, the most critical recommendation deals with prioritization of services. No organization can be all to everybody, and if it tries, it is either less than all to everybody or everything to a few and nothing to others. Whatever the result, prioritization for most organizations is a non-comprehensive incremental process that occurs as the workload increases. This may be okay in the initial stages of an increasing workload, but ultimately it will lead to inefficiency and in certain cases ineffectiveness. We are recommending that the Park Maintenance Department go through a "rebuilding" process, in which it analyzes and evaluates each function as if that function were the only function the department provided. This analysis and evaluation would include

all known alternatives to providing the service. Once this evaluation was completed, it should be assigned sufficient financial resources including equipment and the "proper and correct" staffing. Each function would then be prioritized in competition with all of the other functions.

Communications is also identified as a critical issue. This issue addresses day-to-day communications and overall departmental communications. Day-to-day communications can in many ways be resolved with a good work order system, which will be addressed later. The term overall departmental communications denotes long term and vision types of communication. this area would include budget information, capital budget information, the long-term goals of the department, etc. Apparently this type of information is not being conveyed at all, and it should be. The department's newsletter would be a good way of achieving this end. Information on what was requested on the budget and what was approved might prove interesting to many of the employees. Information on the projected growth of the department and modifications would be valuable to the employees. Status on this report and its implementation is the type of communication the employees are seeking. They not only want to know what their roles are in "building the building," they also want to know what the blueprints and the architect's drawing of the "building" look like.

There are instances in which the chain of command is not being followed in both upward and downward communication. This needs to be stopped. It undermines middle management in either direction. If this policy is rigidly adhered to by departmental management, it will be much easier to enforce it with staff and with other departments.

We sensed a real need for employee and/or departmental recognition within the department. When MTAS conducted its first study of the Parks and Recreation Department, many of our recommendations focused on recreation. Their implementation of those recommendations and other improvements resulted in significant recognition for Recreation and the individual staff members. Park Maintenance needs to implement steps to gain departmental recognition and recognition for its employees.

# TRAINING

The greatest training need is management training for management and supervisors. This should be an ongoing and customized program for Park Maintenance. The department should prepare such a program in cooperation with the Personnel Department but should not be limited by time or financial

constraints of the Personnel Department. A needs assessment should be conducted in advance of the development of a management training curriculum.

## **FINANCE**

Once the recommendations on "rebuilding" the department are completed, management should explain its program to the city administration and the relationship between resources and services provided for each building element. Management should vigorously defend its program and resist accepting new responsibilities, without additional resources or the deletion of an equivalent existing responsibility.

All management and supervisory personnel should be more involved in preparing and "managing" the department's budget. Clerical staff are maintaining an expense ledger and if this is necessary and is to be continued, it should be done on computer. During the course of this study, we found very few people who were familiar with the final budget product and were certainly not familiar with the management of the budget. They simply spent money until the well ran dry. This is not a good way to manage and results in cost overruns, which have occurred within the department.

The rigidity of the purchasing system causes problems in production and seems to be consuming an inordinate amount of supervision's time. This is a common problem with most public entities and we are not sure if it is as serious as explained. If it is, we recommend a discussion session between the department's management and supervision and the Purchasing Agent to see if these problems can be resolved.

# **OPERATIONS**

There were many recommendations in the operations section that need to be addressed, however, one of the more serious is contracting services. This option should be considered for every service the department provides and especially on those specialized and low frequency services. It should also be considered for those services such as tree trimming, where there is such a backlog. The contracting would be limited to removing the backlog. Contracting should not be viewed as taking away from existing jobs, for with sufficient flexibility in timing and personnel, people can be moved to vacant positions. This makes all staff reductions due to contracting occur through attrition. If this can be achieved, such efforts will be more readily

accepted by staff. Providing services is still a dollars and cents game, and every service should be provided at its highest quality for its lowest cost.

Set-up operations for recreation programs has always been a sore point for the Parks and Recreation staff. The timing of requests and the perceived disregard that the requesting party and the providing party have for each other exaggerates problems. To resolve this, we recommend establishing a crew for doing program set-ups. This would be the crew's primary responsibility and it would perform other functions as time allowed. Currently this process is reversed and no one seems to be happy. Our recommendation is based on our observations of Greensboro, North Carolina. We also recommend the department review the set-up function and acquire whatever equipment necessary to minimize the manpower and time required to provide this service.

Supplies, their acquisition, delivery, retention and possible theft are a continuing concern. Part of this concern can be reconciled with the purchasing process and a good inventory reorder system. Standing or open purchase orders would eliminate delays on ordering high frequency items and a good inventory order system would help in preventing unanticipated stock deletions. Delivery of supplies should focus on the user's need only and not on other factors or functions. Placing more responsibility on users to calculate and measure their usage of supplies will determine whether theft is taking place. Supplies are an important factor, but the process should be smooth enough that they don't continue as a major concern.

An electronic work order system is a critical need for the department. Not only from the standpoint of managing day-to-day assignments, but in capturing a history that serves as a management tool for future activities. If the budget analysts are approved, this should be one of their first, if not their very first assignment. They should search the market for a good and tested work order system for park maintenance and adapt the same for Chattanooga.

Facility or building maintenance is always an issue regardless of how it is organized and staffed, however, in Chattanooga it may be a greater issue than normal. The city currently has more than one building maintenance unit. This structure is a holdover from the prior form of government, in which each commissioner had his/her own maintenance program. This may have been fine under the prior system, but in the current system we find a unit in the Park and Recreation Department that is insufficiently staffed to always handle the department's maintenance needs. We recommend the department request the mayor to conduct a study of consolidating all building maintenance functions within the city and to

simultaneously review and identify those maintenance functions that should be contracted. Knoxville has functioned very well with a consolidated system.

Inspection and maintenance of playground equipment is a big ticket item for safety and risk management and is not being adequately addressed. We often tend to not worry about such activities until we have an accident. By that time, it is too late; therefore, we recommend establishing an inspection schedule and checklist and an accompanying maintenance policy that addresses the needs of this area. Such efforts should be coordinated with the city's safety officer.

During the four discussion sessions, we made several attempts to identify services and their respective service standards. We were not always successful and when we were, we found significant variances in the understanding of the service standards. As the department goes through the process of "rebuilding" itself, it should identify service standards for each service it provides. These standards should be based on fixed criteria and should be applicable to any new services or service areas that are added to the department.

## PERSONNEL

The personnel operations of hiring and promotions, at least within the department, are perceived to be based on favoritism instead of a fixed and fair criteria. This may only be perception, but in many cases perceptions become reality. We recommend a review of the hiring and promotions process to be sure it is fair and if it is, we also recommend making all department employees fully informed of the process and the practices. Management should always be open to specific questions on this issue and make sure that it provides a specific answer. The atmosphere should be open and employees should feel free to discuss these issues without fear of retaliation.

No one, and we repeat no one, seemed to be happy with the performance evaluation. With this level of dissatisfaction, this is either a bad evaluation system or it has been poorly administered. We are not sure which is the case, but everyone should not be dissatisfied. We recommend management review the evaluation system with personnel and possibly include representatives from the workforce to identify problems and/or clarify misperceptions. We don't believe this issue has yet affected morale; but if it is not addressed, it will.

We heard employees expressing real concern over the unfairness of the pay plan among existing employees and the problems the department is having in recruiting quality workers. If management has high performance expectations of its workers,

it should continually work to insure their compensation is competitive and fair. We recommend a review of each job position as the "rebuilding" process takes place. We also suggest the department request Personnel to provide its latest wage comparison study for distribution to the workforce.

# MAJOR RECOMMENDATIONS

- \*\* Create and fill two (2) budget analyst positions for the Parks and Recreation Department.
- \*\* Build or buy a facility to centralize all park maintenance operations.
- \*\* The Park Maintenance Department should go through a "rebuilding" process, in which it analyzes and evaluates each function as if that function were the only function the department provided.
- \*\* Improve conveyance of major types of information, budget, goals, etc., via various means including the departmental newsletter.
- \*\* Rigidly adhere to the chain of command in both upward and downward communication.
- \*\* Implement steps to gain departmental recognition and recognition for departmental employees.
- \*\* Work with personnel to develop a management and supervision training curriculum for departmental managers and supervisors.
- \*\* Budgetarily clearly define the relationship between a unit of service and a corresponding unit of resources. Use this work to strongly defend the department when additional services are added without equivalent resources.
- \*\* All management and supervisory personnel should be more involved in preparing and managing the department's budget.
- \*\* Work with purchasing to evaluate the purchasing system, make modifications where necessary and inform the supervisors and employees how it works.
- \*\* Investigate and consider the option of contracting every service the department provides.

- \*\* Create a permanent "set-up" crew within the Park Maintenance Department and utilize them on other functions when they are not doing set-ups.
- \*\* The delivery of supplies should focus on the user's needs only and not on other factors or functions.
- \*\* Study other departments in other cities and develop a "good" electronic work order system.
- \*\* Request the Mayor to study consolidation of all building maintenance within the city.
- \*\* Develop and implement an inspection and maintenance program for all playground equipment.
- \*\* As the department goes through the process of "rebuilding" itself, it should identify service standards for each service it provides.
- \*\* Review the hiring and promotions process to be sure it is fair and if it is, make all department employees fully informed of the process and the practices.
- \*\* Management should review the evaluation system with Personnel and possibly include representatives from the workforce to identify problems and/or clarify misperceptions.
- \*\* Review each job position as the "rebuilding" process takes place.

This concludes our summary review of the study. Following are the specific recommendations of the study as derived from the sessions with the workforce.

## ISSUES AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### ORGANIZATION

Prioritization--Employees, supervisors, and recreation management felt there was a need to prioritize work orders and possibly allocate personnel or crews accordingly. For example, there was concern that roving custodial crews were misassigned and should be used only for the small centers. Floor stripping should be contracted when possible.

Recommendation--Develop and implement a good "electronic" work order system. Supervision working as a "team" should develop an order of priority on all maintenance functions. A budget analyst should review the allocation of custodial personnel and the feasibility of contracting recreation center-related services, i.e., floor stripping.

#### \*\*\*\*\*

Chain of Command--Employees and supervisors had frequent comments regarding the department and the city government in general being unable to consistently follow a chain of command. This results in an "unofficial" system, which people have to work within to get their job accomplished. Individual personalities play too large of a role in such unofficial systems, which in turn, hampers productivity and efficiency.

Recommendation -- Review and modify if needed the department's organizational chart. All personnel including management, supervisors, and rank and file employees should become familiar with that organizational chart and its chain of command. personnel should follow the up and down flow of the chain of command, and staff should be encouraged to identify instances in which it is violated. The chain of command should be followed, even on directives from the mayor. The chain of command should be as streamlined as possible and work teams should be developed where possible. Work assignments should be directed from the top down. All activity, work orders and general orders should stay within the chain of command.

# \*\*\*\*\*

Supervisor and Employee Autonomy--Supervisors and employees should have the discretionary authority to make certain types of decisions, without everything being directed by upper management. Supervisors need to be able to provide more hands-on supervision.

Recommendation--Management should encourage and assist lower level supervisors and employees in decision making. Where possible, work teams should be developed and team decisions should be encouraged.

\*\*\*\*\*

Communications--There appears to be communication problems in every direction--top, down, bottom up and crossways. Directors bypass supervisors, and supervisors contradict each other. No input is allowed or accepted from the employees. In essence, there is no team work within the department.

Recommendation—Both formal and informal channels of communication should be developed. The employee newsletter should become more informational on the business activities of the department, instead of the social activities. Fixed time should be allocated for staff and/or team meetings to discuss current activities, next week's or next month's schedule, and problems in the workplace. Management should continually rotate among these team meetings. An incentive plan for departmental improvements should be encouraged.

\*\*\*\*\*

Employee Recognition--Supervisors need to support their workers and frequently offer words of encouragement. There seems to be a lack of individual employee and crew recognition and a feeling that no credit is given for good job performance. Employees feel they do not share in the department's celebrations and awards.

Recommendation—An employee recognition program needs to be developed. This could be an employee of the month or something of that nature, with defined selection criteria and possibly include recognition by the mayor. In addition to this effort, management needs to continually recognize good performance on the part of its employees. Performance would not only include a job well done, but good attendance records, loyalty to the department, good attitude, etc.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Supervisors--Some employees feel there are too many supervisors and that they lack the expertise to evaluate crafts and landscaping.

Recommendation--This issue should be incorporated into an overall review of structure. In many instances a working foreman or leadman will be more efficient than

a supervisor. Management and technical training should be offered to and required of all supervisors and managers.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Staffing and Manpower--There is a feeling that craftsmen are going to be phased out of the Parks Maintenance Department. More construction manpower for infield work is needed. There is a need for more daily maintenance help, as there is a manpower shortage with no backup. Crew size is insufficient for tree trimming on streets, i.e., handling traffic, etc.

Recommendation--The building maintenance functions in park maintenance and within the other departments of the city should be consolidated into a Municipal Building Maintenance Department and placed, if possible, in a non-user or low-user division. In many instances, one specialized craftsman in a department is not sufficient for certain jobs. Building maintenance is the same whether it is city hall, a recreation center or a fire hall. In conjunction with this consolidation, a study should be conducted to establish a preventive maintenance program to identify "maintenance" that will be performed by city staff and the maintenance that would be more cost effective to contract.

Infield construction should be studied and a schedule for reconstructing all infields on a systematic basis should be established. Once this is completed, a crew sized correctly for the work to be performed should be established, and the equipment should be reviewed to be sure it is the best for the job. Other maintenance programs should be studied to see if they have identified ways to eliminate or lessen this reconstruction effort.

If work is prioritized and crews are established accordingly, a lower function crew should be utilized as a manpower pool for staffing the higher priority crews.

Tree trimming crews working on the street should be provided with a flagman, and the whole crew should be trained in worksite traffic management.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Organization and Management Evaluation--The department lacks the time and expertise to evaluate its operating systems and to make recommendations for new systems and improvements to current systems.

Recommendation--Hire at least one and preferably two budget analysts to perform studies on specific programs and program alternatives.

Hire the superintendent a personal secretary.

#### TRAINING

Hazardous Materials -- Little to no training on this subject.

Recommendation--The City of Chattanooga must offer greater training opportunities to parks personnel. As the risk management operation becomes more viable, opportunities should become more available. Supervisors should be aware of the needs of the employees. A needs assessment for training on hazardous materials should be completed. Storage, handling, and dispensing of hazardous chemicals should be identified within the department.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Recycling--Need to teach children and directors about recycling.

Recommendation--Recreation supervisors and center directors should offer programs for their users as to the importance of recycling. The department should work with various community agencies to develop recycling operations in the centers. This should reduce the overall workload for the janitorial staff.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Supervisors -- Need more supervisory or management training.

Recommendation--The department should take full advantage of supervisory courses offered by UT's Center for Government Training and other agencies and should require in-service training among the supervisory staff.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Licensed Positions -- Need to reimburse for training for specific licenses.

Recommendation--The department should reimburse any employee who is required to obtain a specific license or any form of qualification to perform the job.

#### FINANCE

Additions and No Resources--Additional functions, services and service areas are being added without adding corresponding resources.

Recommendation--The department should work to ensure adequate funding for staffing and equipment is provided any time additional duties, facilities or programs are offered.

\*\*\*\*\*

Budget--Supervisors and employees have little to no input on the budget and are never updated on the budget that is passed and exactly what it contains in terms of programs and activities.

Recommendation--Supervisors and employees should have as much input into the budget process as feasible. Updates and budget projections should be offered on a monthly basis for all supervisors. Employees should be encouraged and rewarded with any recommendations for any efficiencies they may recommend.

\*\*\*\*\*

Purchasing--The purchase order process takes too long unless a purchase order is "walked through" the system. This causes problems in ordering parts. The rigidity of the low bid results in multiple brands of equipment and sometimes purchases of lower quality.

Recommendation--The city should increase the amount of purchase before bidding is required. Supervisors should become familiar with the purchasing requirements and the bidding procedures. The department should work with the city purchasing director to develop a more streamlined approach for the ordering of materials and supplies. Bulk quantities should be purchased when possible. A warehouse operation should be implemented within the department.

#### **OPERATIONS**

Centralized Facility--Park Maintenance currently shares office space and clerical support with Recreation. This may enhance communication between the two departments, but it ultimately hampers communication within each department. Each has a separate focus and responsibility. Park Maintenance is further decentralized in that its various functions construction, landscaping, building maintenance, etc., are housed in various facilities at Warner Park with the Zoo and playground scattered in between. Such a system would be comparable to taking a police department and putting patrol in one building, investigations in another and administration in another, with each building in a different sector of the city.

Such a system severely limits management's ability to manage the Park Maintenance Department.

Recommendation—We recommend the city resolve to centralize Park Maintenance operations and either acquire or build a facility for that purpose. Such a facility would house all Park Maintenance management and staff (excluding the Plaza operations) and all equipment and materials. It would enhance both staffing efficiency and equipment utilization. It would provide for centralized knowledge of the daily and weekly activities of Park Maintenance.

\*\*\*\*\*

Absentee Reporting--Employees identified problems with the current absentee reporting system and its impact on work scheduling.

Recommendation--Consider using an answering machine for reporting absences instead of waiting until work time to make the report to a supervisor. Answering machine reporting would allow the supervisor to know about his absences before work time and he could set his work schedules accordingly.

\*\*\*\*\*

Garbage Collection--The new program where the Sanitation Department is collecting garbage at each recreation center is causing timing problems for the mobile custodial crew.

Recommendation -- The city should consider mechanizing garbage collection and placing a mechanized container at every center.

\*\*\*\*\*

Theft--Some of the custodians believe there is a pilfering of supplies.

Recommendation--Stricter inventory should be maintained by directors and supervisors at the recreation centers. An inventory control system should be developed after supplies are delivered. This would assist with the reordering of supplies as well as theft problems.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Saturday Work--Maintenance people would prefer to have their work completed Monday through Friday and do away with Saturday.

Recommendation -- Select a pilot recreation center(s) to operate a Monday through Friday cleaning schedule.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Cleaning--Recreation center directors need to enforce the rules about prohibiting eating in the gym and requiring groups to clean up after their events.

Recommendation--Ensure that recreation center directors enforce the rules of prohibiting eating in the centers and requiring groups to clean up after their reserved events. Develop cleaning standards and time allowance for adequately cleaning the recreation centers. Some centers need more time/employees to assist in the cleaning. Determinations of time, equipment and staffing should be developed for each center. Recreation center directors should make a final inspection, especially in bathroom areas, every evening before closing the center. Contracts for vermin control should be continued and expanded.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Tree Trimming--There is a problem in working through a backlog of work orders, which may be two years old.

Recommendation--Explore the possibility of contracting some of the backlog. The current tree crew is slowly reducing the backlog.

\*\*\*\*\*

Contracting Services -- These services should be investigated and implemented where feasible. A definite possibility for the backlog of tree trimming work orders.

Recommendation--Examples of contracting services include tree trimming, some janitorial services, electrical and other construction operations. Some grass cutting operations may be contracted. A budget analyst should be used to explore the feasibility of contracting a number of routine services.

# \*\*\*\*\*\*

Work Order System--In many instances the work order system is not existent; and, in most instances where it does exist, it is insufficient.

Recommendation—A work order system is critical for the department. Not only in managing the day—to—day assignments, but in capturing a history that serves as a management tool for future activities. The department should search the market for a good and tested work order system that is adaptable to Chattanooga.

#### \*\*\*\*\*\*

Custodial Support--There is an overall lack of back-up equipment to replace vacuum cleaners, etc., if one breaks down. There is also a shortage of supplies from time to time.

Recommendation--More back-up equipment should be purchased. Examples given were the shortage of vacuum cleaners, cleaning supplies, etc. Many times work has to be postponed due to the lack of proper equipment and supplies on-hand. The custodial staff should be contacted frequently to determine its most pressing needs.

# \*\*\*\*\*

East Lake Park--Needs a larger lawn mower.

Recommendation--It was reported that East Lake Park needs larger mowing equipment. Areas of mowing that overlap with public works should be determined. Contracting mowing operations should be explored, especially in low priority areas.

# \*\*\*\*\*\*

Set-Ups--Need lighter tables, chair racks and table racks.

Recommendation--Develop a "set-up" crew, whose priority is set-up work for Recreation. This crew would perform other park maintenance tasks when not doing set-up work for Recreation. This crew would need to be properly

equipped for doing their job with the least amount of manpower. Long term, the department should purchase lighter tables, chair racks and table racks.

To enhance this change and eliminate some of the current confusion and hassle of set-up work, Recreation supervisors should submit their schedule and needs to the crew on Thursday of the prior week. This would allow the crew to plan their following week on Friday and follow-up with Recreation supervisors if they have any questions.

#### \*\*\*\*\*

Facility Maintenance--Roof repair not inspected and not a recognized problem. Window cleaning needs consistency with materials and supplies. Bathroom clean-up needs stronger cleaners and more mopping.

Recommendation--Roof repair is not inspected. Investigate using city inspection bureau to handle building inspections for large contracted operations. Stronger cleaners are needed for many bathrooms in recreation centers. Inside inspection must be improved by directors and by maintenance operations.

# \*\*\*\*\*\*

Equipment--There is possible equipment abuse by employees and management.

Recommendation--Verify whether the equipment is being abused. If it is, establish an equipment checklist that each operator will use in checking the equipment each time before it is used.

#### \*\*\*\*\*

Decision on Housing Authority Centers--The quality of service provided to the Housing Authority Centers is not satisfactory to any of the parties involved, yet no one is taking responsibility or making positive decisions.

Recommendation -- Work with Housing Authority to provide cleaning operations, or pull the recreation directors out of the facilities.

#### \*\*\*\*\*

Light Replacement -- Light bulb replacement is a hassle for all involved, including the people at the recreation center and the maintenance people that change the lights.

Recommendation--Order better quality light bulbs, and respond quicker to light bulb changing. Replace light bulbs on a scheduled basis, assign responsibility to one person, (team). Utilize custodians to change lights where possible, especially at lower elevations.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Security--Employees expressed concern over security of facilities and people. The concern focused mainly on the recreation centers.

Recommendation--Have more police patrols. Install effective locking system and security systems in the recreation centers. Better outside lighting should be installed.

\*\*\*\*\*

Supplies--Availability of supplies is frequently a problem. With the current organizational structure, a lot of finger pointing is going on as to who or what is the problem.

Recommendation--Directors need to know what equipment is available. Supplies operation should come under the recreation division. Directors report that the quality of the equipment is poor.

\*\*\*\*\*\*

Landscaping Recreation Centers--Concern was expressed over the visual aesthetics of the recreation centers, especially the landscaping.

Recommendation--Provide base services for landscaping to deal with problem areas. Directors should maintain responsibility for upkeep.

\*\*\*\*\*

Playground Equipment Inspection--This function is performed by the same personnel that does set-up work for recreation. Therefore the actual inspection is very limited and on no consistent basis.

Recommendation--Use the current safety officer or identify a new safety officer, who would work with risk management to develop, implement and carry out a detailed playground equipment inspection program. This safety officer, working with risk management, would take the lead in safety training and safety inspection for all other facets of the department. This safety

officer might also be assigned an employee to repair all defective playground equipment.

#### PERSONNEL

Hiring and Promotions--There is favoritism in promotions, referred to as a "buddy/buddy" system. Supervision is prepicked. There is nepotism in hiring, and lateral hiring of supervision is not good. There is a lack of opportunity for promotions and advancement.

Recommendation--This may only be perception, but in many instances perception is the same as reality. Employees should become fully informed on the process of personnel selection. If nepotism is against city policy, such policy should be rigidly followed. If nepotism is not against city policy, the department should be an advocate for such a policy and should adhere to a rigid nepotism policy for the department, even if it is unwritten.

The process of promotion should be fully explained and all personnel who qualify should have an opportunity to apply and be encouraged to apply.

Sometimes lateral hiring is necessary and such need should be explained to the employees. Just because the city fills a position by lateral hiring, this should not stifle any employee from preparing themselves for positions in the future.

A workable grievance procedure should be established and explained to the employees. Grievances should be promptly addressed and resolved. Frivolous grievances should be discouraged and "buddy/buddy" activity in work assignments should be corrected.

\*\*\*\*\*

Performance Evaluation--It is "unfair," "a joke." There is a need for differentials in job descriptions, and there is a lack of incentives and lack of merit raises.

Recommendation--The employees' lack of respect for the evaluation program should be explained to Personnel and the city administration. The department should encourage a total review of this program by Personnel and should also encourage Personnel to do a comparison of each department as it pertains to employee satisfaction and respect for the program.

The department should investigate the possibility of pay differentials for certain types of work and should also encourage the city to look at merit pay as it reviews the performance evaluation program. Merit pay might be on a team or unit basis based on their success in work order completion and job quality.

#### \*\*\*\*\*\*

Pay Plan--Pay scale should offer a differential for roving crew and crew leader. Step plan is too long, and starting wages are too low. Should pay for experience.

Recommendation -- Each of these issues should be discussed with Personnel and answers provided to the employees.

#### \*\*\*\*\*\*

Communications -- Personnel Department needs to communicate information more frequently and better.

Recommendation--Personnel needs a newsletter for all employees or should provide a segment for the department's letter. Such a segment might address current issues or might periodically have a listing of questions and answers. Employees would be encouraged to provide questions.

# THREE THINGS EMPLOYEES WOULD DO AS SUPERINTENDENT

# **ORGANIZATION**

- \* Hold weekly staff meetings.
- \* Reduce the number of foremen and convert some or all of them to crew leaders.
- \* Reestablish supervisory authority and adhere to the chain of command.
- \* Clarify the responsibilities (job descriptions) of all employees.
- \* Hire the superintendent a personal secretary.
- \* Defend the department with city personnel, other city departments and the rest of the city administration.
- \* Be accessible to all employees.
- \* Listen to employees and improve communications within the department.
- \* Fill all existing and future vacancies immediately.
- \* Form a steering and planning committee comprised of work force members and members of management, and work to develop a team approach to management and daily work.
- \* Visit work sites more frequently and let employees know they are appreciated.
- \* Establish priorities for the workload.

# **OPERATIONS**

- \* Redistribute the workload.
- \* Establish work schedules.
- \* Resolve paperwork problems.
- \* Hire work people.
- \* Establish a departmental-wide work order system.

- \* Eliminate the weekend work schedule for recreation centers.
- Provide more supplies and better supplies.
- Contract the backlog on tree trimming work orders.
- \* Contract all specialized/low frequency work orders.
- \* Upgrade the equipment.
- \* Establish and implement a preventative maintenance program in all possible maintenance functions.
- \* Provide winter uniforms and rain jackets and then implement and enforce a dress code.
- \* Improve plaza maintenance facilities.
- \* Improve facilities for equipment storage.

#### PERSONNEL

- \* Respect employees and provide "praise" where possible, and often.
- \* Take steps to eliminate favoritism in promotions, pay raises and in hiring.
- \* Enhance benefit program, especially by adding sick leave and increasing the carry over on vacation leave from one year to the next year.
- \* Remove the Tennessee residency requirement for employment.
- \* Train supervisors to do employee evaluations and management to do supervisory evaluations.
- \* Conduct a study of the pay plan, upgrade pay for certain jobs, pay for performance where appropriate, and pay overtime instead of comp time. Incorporate bonuses or other types of incentive plans.
- \* Hire more employees at the aquarium.
- \* Establish an arbitrator within the Employee Assistance Program and add a drug rehab program.
- \* Establish a review board to review all terminations.

- \* Review all job descriptions and rework where necessary.
- \* Make seniority a factor in most personnel decisions.

fn:g:chat/chatmain.prk

# APPENDICES

# APPENDIX A

# FIRST EMPLOYEE GROUP

# PROBLEMS IDENTIFIED

# **ORGANIZATION**

Need to prioritize work orders and allocate accordingly Adding areas without resources Top to bottom work assignments Remove politics from workforce Need to follow Chain of Command Too many supervisors Performance evaluation; unfair No input from employees Communication problems with Directors No expertise to evaluate crafts and landscaping Contradiction between bosses Lack of support from supervisor Lack of decision making - Supervisors Feeling that craftsmen are going to be phased out No team work Employees not sharing in celebrations and awards Transfer craftsmen to public works No autonomy - Supervisors & Employees More construction manpower, infields More daily maintenance help; manpower shortage; no backup Crew size insufficient for tree trimming on streets

# **FINANCE**

Delay in purchase orders weekly and ordering parts Low bid changing Lack of input on budget

# **OPERATIONS**

Answering machine for reporting absence
Time Frame & scheduling problems
Garbage pick-up--Not enough time to set out and coordinate with pick-up
Directors--Carrying off supplies
Set-up for Monday-Friday; Do away with Sat. work
Clean Gyms-go by the rules-No eating
Groups need to clean up after events, enforce consistently

Old work orders-Tree trimming Contracting vs. in-house Work order system out of whack More hands-on supervision Lack of back-up equipment; equipment & supplies shortage Larger lawn mower-East Lake Park (watch bldg. size) Need a dumpster at every Center Set-ups--use lighter tables, chair racks, table rack Bathroom clean-up; stronger cleaners; mopping Playground maintenance-install more effective cans Windows-consistency w/materials/supplies Equipment Maintenance Equipment Abuse (emp. & mgmt) Plaza maintenance facility Roof repair--not inspected, not a recognized problem Old drainage system

# **SAFETY**

Safety problems--haz. material-procedures Work with director--safety concerns

# **PERSONNEL**

Should pay experience Buddy/buddy promotions Remove politics from workforce Performance evaluation; unfair Leave/have to use days Pay scale; pay differential for roving crew and crew leader Lack of recognition--individual employee, crews Step plan (pay) too long Low starting wages Lateral hiring of supervision Pre-picking supervision Favoritism No credit given Lack of opportunity for promotions and advancement Yearly evaluation is a joke Low entry level pay Need for differentials in job descriptions Lack of incentives No merit raises Nepotism in hiring Information from the personnel department needed Construction (ballfields)

# **TRAINING**

Training
Teach kids and directors about recycling
Need supervisory training
Reimbursement for training for specific licenses
Little or no hazardous material training

# **TOP THREE ITEMS**

# **ORGANIZATION**

More staff meetings/weekly Reduce foremen # to crew leaders Establish authority Clarify responsibilities of employees Hire personal secretary Defend department Accessible to all employees Improve communications Listen Fill vacancies Committee of work force & mgmt. Visit work sites-mgmt. Chain of Command Team players Better planning Prioritize workload

# **FINANCE**

0

# **OPERATIONS**

Redivide work force
Establish work schedule
Resolve paperwork problems
Hire more people
Work order system
Weekend work schedule for rec. centers
More/better supplies
Contract tree work order
Contract specialized work
Better equipment (upgrade)
Preventative maintenance
Uniforms needed--Winter, rain jackets, dress code
Improve plaza maintenance facilities
Improve equipment storage

# **SAFETY**

0

# **PERSONNEL**

Greater respect for employees "praise" Eliminate favoritism More Sick time Correct vacation problems TN Resident for employment Employee Evaluation/Supervision Upgrade pay for job Review hiring practices Unfair pay raises/study E.A.P. arbitrator Est. Review Board for firings Pay overtime instead of comp time Drug rehab Bonus/incentives Rework job descriptions Utilize seniority Pay for performance More employees at aquarium

# **TRAINING**

More training

# SERVICES BY GRADE

# **GRADED A**

- 1. Mop all Non-Carpeted Floors
- 2. Clean Restrooms
- 3. Wash Windows/Mirrors
- 4. Clean Restrooms at Greenway
- 5. Change Non-Florescent Bulbs
- 6. Clean Appliances
- 7. Clean Backboards
- 8. Mow/Maintain Outside
- 9. Garbage and Recycling to Curb
- 10. Vacuum Carpet
- 11. Strip Floors
- 12. Clean Swimming Pool
- 13. Sweeping
- 14. Answer Phone
- 15. Power House/Warner Park
- 16. Push Dust Mop
- 17. Clean Windows
- 18. Mowing Fields
- 19. Welding/Handrails
- 20. Cut Grass "Handwork"
- 21. Truck Driver/Construction
- 22. Bathroom Cleaning
- 23. Electrician
- 24. Rake Plots
- 25. Cabinetry
- 26. Greenhouse
- 27. Clean Pools
- 28. Plant Trees
- 29. Landscaping Activities Deal with Homeless
- 30. Plaza Landscaping (Planting)
- 31. Plaza Mowing
- 32. Park Landscaping (Plant Flowers)
- 33. Planting Roses
- 34. Sweep Plaza
- 35. Mulching
- 36. Drag Fields
- 37. Rose Garden Spraying
- 38. Front Fountain Maintenance
- 39. Concrete
- 40. Fertilize
- 41. Reseeding Ballfields

- 42. Chain Belts, Heat and Air Filters, Etc. (Equipment)
- 43. Preventive Bids
- 44. Line Off Ballfields (6 fields)
- 45. Run Foul Lines
- 46. Restrooms
- 47. Repair Small Appliances
- 48. Mail
- 49. Trim Park/Weed Eat
- 50. Tree Removal Storms
- 51. Littering Plaza
- 52. Check Refrigerator Levels
- 53. Payroll
- 54. Direct Traffic
- 55. Bridge Maint. (Inspect)

# **GRADED B**

- 1. Clean Crew/Clean 8 Centers
- 2. Plumbing Repairs
- 3. Litter Outside
- 4. Playground Maintenance
- 5. Clean Office
- 6. Mopping
- 7. Ballfields Lining
- 8. Heating and Air
- 9. Landscaping Planting
- 10. Tractor Driver
- 11. Plant Trees
- 12. Mulching Flower Beds (Better Org.)
- 13. Certified Swimming Pool Operator
- 14. Handle Ballfields Pickup (Scheduling/Organization)
- 15. Plumbing for 65 Facilities
- 16. Maintain Stream at Aquarium
- 17. Clean Water Wall Jets (Rain washes bedding material)
- 18. Pruning
- 19. Cut Grass Over City
- 20. Rebuild Infields
- 21. Needed Flower Beds
- 22. Plant Shrubs/Replacing/Flowers/Trees
- 23. Garbage Collection (Ross Landing Plaza)
- 24. Order Specific Supplies
- 25. Build/Replacing Fence
- 26. Fountain and Stream Maint.
- 27. Irrigation
- 28. Rake and Mulch Leaves

# GRADED C

- 1. Floor Quality of Non-Carpeted Floors
- 2. Litter Collection Outside
- 3. Rake Leaves
- 4. Painting
- 5. Communications with Director
- 6. Set-Up
- 7. Clean Gym/Ceramic Room
- 8. Vacuum
- 9. 26 Plots
- 10. Trash Hauling
- 11. Working at Greenhouse
- 12. Ballfields Catch Basin (No Planning)
- 13. Lay Sod Grass
- 14. Irrigation (No Expertise)
- 15. Get Crew Together
- 16. "Billy Goat" Plaza
- 17. Haul Trash to Summit
- 18. Odd Jobs -- Haul Dirt, Mulch (Too much)
- 19. Top Trees
- 20. Construct and Rebuild In-Fields
- 21. Maint. Painting Indoor/Outdoor
- 22. Tree Trimming (Priority 1, 2, & 3/Streets Second)
- 23. Storm Drain
- 24. Tree Pruning
- 25. Garbage Collection
- 26. Cut Grass Over City
- 27. Trim Shrubs/Plaza

# GRADED D

- 1. Clean Tennis Courts (Lack of Blower Problem)
- 2. Change Florescent Bulbs
- 3. Garbage Pick-Up Monday
- 4. Bathroom Clean-Up
- 5. Work with Contractors
- 6. Fence Lines
- 7. Cut Grass
- 8. General Maintenance (No Preventative)
- 9. Trim Shrubs (Wait Too Long)
- 10. Build and Repair Carpentry (Doors and Tables) (Vandalism)
- 11. Roof Repair
- 12. Fence Repair

- 13. Order Supplies
- 14. Repair Mowers
- 15. Trim Trees

# **GRADED F**

- 1. Playground Maint./Inspection
- 2. Mow/Maintain Outside
- 3. Summer Food Program
- 4. Pick Up Materials Need For Warehouse (Time, No Inventory)
- 5. Haul Bleachers (No Notification)
- 6. Building Inspection
- 7. Road Repair Gravel
- 8. Chemical Spraying (Ross's Landing)
- 9. Drive Truck

#### APPENDIX B

## **RECREATION GROUP**

#### PROBLEMS IDENTIFIED

## **ORGANIZATION**

<u>Work Schedules</u> - Use roving only for small centers. Look into contracting some services and centers. Striping crew needed or contract. Problem with Parks Maintenance over cleaning. Lack of recognition. Who cleans housing authority??

## FINANCE

0

## **OPERATIONS**

<u>Cleaning Facilities</u> - More time to clean the building. Not in favor of roving crews. Lee doesn't have enough authority.

Repair Facilities - Hire more specialists. Utilize specialists.

- Need to have supplies -- Schedule for Preventive Maintenance.
- Inventory
- Contracting repairs
- Inspection of contractors job
- Scheduling timeframe for work orders
- Preventive
- Communication with Directors

<u>Replace Lights</u> - Order better bulbs. Assign responsibility to one person. Supply checklist with inspection.

Emergency Repairs - Doing good job. Need definition of emergency.

<u>Electrical Maintenance</u> - Problems with construction. Too busy. Go after the problem; fixing symptoms instead.

<u>Security</u> - Need to install security systems. Maintain existing facilities. Locks need fixed. Need silent alarms. Better outside lighting. Need police patrolling.

<u>Cut Grass</u> - Inconsistent quality -- trimming, bleachers. Need for landscaping to cut down on mud, etc.

<u>Carpentry</u> - Not getting good service. Recreation has low priority. Don't understand importance of need. Look to contract. Establish criteria for contract jobs.

<u>Playground Inspection</u> - Not being done. Don't know if anyone is assigned. Are they trained? Inspection at least once a month.

<u>Playground Repair</u> - Good at removing problems, but <u>slow to replace</u>. Poor ground cover. Replace equipment in one month as a standard.

Ground Cover for Playgrounds - Replace during Spring. Grass coming up through cover.

<u>Painting and Graffiti Removal</u> - Treat as soon as possible. Directors should take greater responsibility for inside graffiti, within one week. Also director to cover problems with paint.

<u>Inside Facility Inspection</u> - Director responsibility. Preventative maintenance. Bottleneck. Work order system too slow. Caretakers need more authority and supplies.

<u>Vermin Control</u> - Routine spraying at housing authority.

<u>Signs</u> - Dept. has completed requests. Need handicapped and no parking signs. Not put up on time.

<u>Ball Field Maintenance</u> - Poor in the summer. Recreation use to have own person. Person assigned to Warner and Montague. Now dragging. Need to water infields during droughts. Need to start early in the year and turn over the field. Cut ridges to help drainage. Problem with Rec. Centers fields. Outfields not maintained.

<u>Ball Field Construction</u> - Rec. Center fields are given low priority. Every three years, all fields should be constructed. Need to work on in Full.

<u>Set-Up for Special Events</u> - Move equipment easier. Need to be more cooperative. Need trained personnel assigned to assist. Parks should respect requests of Directors. Centers need more tables and chairs.

Garbage Collection - Dumpster. Recycling.

Junk-Trash-Brush - Major problem. Schedule of pick-up. Policy set on break-down.

<u>Landscaping at Rec. Centers</u> - Only mow the grass. Need to landscape to help cut down on problems. Non-existent. Directors to take responsibility for upkeep.

<u>Supply Provided</u> - Let Recreation have control of supplies. Reordering for inventory to be filled. Quality of equipment is poor. Supply director needs to be more cooperative. Supply should come under Recreation Division.

<u>Supply - Games</u> - Directors need to know what can be ordered. Communication with supply clerk. Supplies should be delivered to centers or at staff meetings. Computerization needed.

<u>Design Consultation</u> - Input needed from Directors.

Grading of Driveways - Pave Patton Center. Pave as much as possible.

ADA Conversion - No construction yet.

Fencing Ballfields - On schedule.

Sidewalk - On schedule.

Housing Authority Cleaning - Policy needed between Housing and Recreation. If no agreement, back out of Rec.

Tree Maintenance - Not getting response -- blocking lights, dead trees.

Swimming Pool Maintenance - Good.

<u>Heating and A.C.</u> - Old system replacing on 5 yr. cycle. Preventive maintenance. Design problems. Need insulation.

Bus Maintenance

## **SAFETY**

0

## **PERSONNEL**

0

## **TRAINING**

<u>Training of Caretakers</u> - Responsibilities of Caretaker and Recreation Director need to be explained →Roving crews need better designed vehicles for job - <u>Reschedule Time</u> for workers. Evaluate busiest centers - full-time assignments.

## TOP THREE ITEMS

## **ORGANIZATION**

Meet With All Divisions and Ask for Needs
More Communications
Direct staff - new attitude - Recreation priority
Establish softball in-house - use of fees
Determine priorities with employees
Guidelines, chain of command
New facilities - new people
Reorganize Dept. (structure training accordingly)
Advisory Committee of Rec. & Park Personnel to address joint issues
Schedule monthly meetings with Recreation
Eliminate job duplication; re-evaluate store/clerk job
Enhance cooperation and respect between Parks & Rec.

## **FINANCE**

Develop an agreement to add resources as facilities are added

## **OPERATIONS**

Daily cleaning of Rec. centers
Ballfield maintenance - time
Proper preventative maintenance
Caretaker - better supplies, equipment
Redesign facilities - bleachers in all facilities
Framework for special events
Provide cleaning at Housing Authority facilities or pull directors out
Computerize inventories and scheduling
Transfer all supply needs to Recreation
Secure all Rec. sites and facilities
Contract all large maint. jobs

## **SAFETY**

0

## **PERSONNEL**

Hire workers - skilled crafts Remove Buddy-Buddy System Have Supervision treat workers with respect

## **TRAINING**

Rearrange work schedule for custodial and training Direct staff - new attitude - Recreation priority Determine Skills of Workers (structure training accordingly)

## SERVICES BY GRADE

## **GRADED A**

- 1. Garbage Collection (9 months)
- 2. Fencing Ballfields
- 3. Swimming Pool Maintenance
- 4. Masonry Work

## GRADED B

- 1. Emergency Repairs
- 2. Electrical Maintenance
- 3. Cut Grass
- 4. Signage
- 5. Design Consultation
- 6. Construction Sidewalks
- 7. Tree Maintenance
- 8. Heating to Air

## **GRADED C**

- 1. Cleaning Facilities Daily (Rec. Centers)
- 2. Repairing Facilities
- 3. Painting/Graffiti Removal
- 4. Vermin Control (on-call)
- 5. Set-Up Special Events
- 6. Garbage Collection (3 Months)
- 7. Conversion to Meet ADA
- 8. Use of Park Vehicles

## GRADED D

- 1. Security (Locks)
- 2. Playground Repair
- 3. Ground Cover
- 4. Rec. Centers in Summer
- 5. Ballfield Maintenance
- 6. Grading of Driveways

## **GRADED F**

- 1. Replace Lights
- 2. Carpentry Repair and Construction
- 3. Playground Equipment Inspection

- 4.
- Inside Facility Inspection
  Ballfield Construction (Rec. Center Fields) 5.
- Junk/Trash/Brush Collection 6.
- 7. Furniture/Cabinet Construction
- 8.
- Landscape Supplies Provided 9.
- Supplies Games 10.
- 11. Cleaning Housing Authority Facilities (No Agreement)

## APPENDIX C

## SUPERVISORS GROUP

## **TOP THREE ITEMS**

## **ORGANIZATION**

Create Department for Equip. & Materials Give Everyone a Title -- Do Away with Laborers Work Within Own Dept. - Priority for P & R Project Mgmt. -- Work Orders

## **FINANCE**

Increase Funding

## **OPERATIONS**

Limit to Maintenance Work Contract Services Simpler Ordering System for Supplies More Equipment - Purchasing Better Building Facility

## **SAFETY**

0

## <u>PERSONNEL</u>

Give Everyone a Title -- Do Away with Laborers Increase Number of Employees Do Away with Pay Scale Pay People for Worth to Org.

## **TRAINING**

Better Training for All -- Especially Laborers

#### SERVICES BY GRADE

## **GRADED A**

- 1. Stripping Gym Floors
- 2. Zoo Outreach Programs
- 3. Clean-up -- Litter Removal
- 4. New Const. Painting
- 5. Restrooms-Custodial
- 6. Emergency Plumbing
- 7. New Const. Plumbing
- 8. Dragging/Lining Ballfield
- 9. New Const. H & A.C. (Contract)
- 10. Tree Planting
- 11. Shrubs Planting
- 12. Flowers
- 13. Fertilize
- 14. Ever. Welding
- 15. P.M. Heavy Equipment Check
- 16. Transport Trees Alive
- 17. Reseeding
- 18. Assist Ballfield Maint. During Tournament
- 19. Plaza Plant Replacement
- 20. Flag Replacement
- 21. Haul Trash to Landfill
- 22. Take Sick Calls 8 A.M.?
- 23. Inspect Requests Trees
- 24. Soil Test
- 25. Fertilizer Flowers/Shrubs
- 26. Attend Safety Meetings
- 27. Minutes for Tree Advisory
- 28. Emergency Services

## **GRADED B**

- 1. Caring for Animals
- 2. Grading Fields
- 3. Zoo Grounds
- 4. Washing Windows
- 5. Build Parking Lots
- 6. Maintain Miller Park
- 7. Advice for Landscaping to the Public
- 8. Maintain Plots
- 9. Plaza Mowing Grass
- 10. Ever. Electrical

- 11. New Construction
- 12. Tree Removal (Contractual)
- 13. Landscaping Grass Cutting
- 14. Winterization Plumbing
- 15. Demolition
- 16. Ever. H & A.C.
- 17. Ever. Clean-up
- 18. Tree Planting
- 19. Operation Irrigation
- 20. Ever. Carpentry
- 21. Tree Bracing
- 22. New Const. Welding
- 23. Clean-Up Equipment
- 24. Plaza-Pruning
- 25. Construct Flower Beds
- 26. Plaza-Trash/Litter Removal
- 27. Ever. Tree Cutting
- 28. Minor Plaza Equip. Repair P.M.
- 29. Tree Equipment Inspection
- 30. Trash Hauling/Litter Hauling-Warner/Montague
- 31. Pick Up and Deliver Material
- 32. Flag Replacement
- 33. Haul Trash to Landfill
- 34. Landscape Cutting & Pruning Trees
- 35. Plaza Fertilize
- 36. Take Sick Calls 8 A.M.?
- 37. Inspect & Service Equipment
- 38. Meet and Greet Public at Job Site
- 39. Inspect Complaints
- 40. Water Trees/Shrubs
- 41. Pre-Start Job Inspection
- 42. Bld. Pavilions
- 43. Oversee Job Progress
- 44. Attend Meetings
- 45. Survey Work
- 46. Green House Repair
- 47. Design Flower Beds

## **GRADED C**

- 1. Ever. Painting
- 2. Tree Prune Trees
- 3. Build Ballfields
- 4. Tree Removal (Contractual)
- 5. Brush Clean-Up
- 6. P.M. H & A.C.

- 7. Repair Irrigation
- 8. New Const. Carpentry
- 9. Equipment Operator for Other Departments
- 10. Mulching
- 11. Clearing Vacant Lots
- 12. Temp. Fencing for Tournaments
- 13. Plaza Trash/Litter Removal
- 14. Safety Training
- 15. Mulching Playground Equipment
- 16. Pick Up and Deliver Material
- 17. Safety Conscious For Crew
- 18. Meet and Greet Public at Job Site
- 19. Write Reports
- 20. Issue Work Orders
- 21. Site Preparation
- 22. Create Budget
- 23. Interview and Hire
- 24. Write Specs Follow-Up\Bid Openings
- 25. Calculate Material Needs
- 26. Brush Removal
- 27. Funding

## **GRADED D**

- 1. Tennis Court Maintenance/Clean
- 2. Pick-Up Garbage
- 3. Fountain Maint. (Contract/In-House)
- 4. P.M. H & A.C.
- 5. Construction Drainage
- 6. Fence Repair?? \$ No Standard
- 7. Bld. Containment Areas for Playgrounds & Flower Beds
- 8. Haul Bleachers and Picnic Tables, Set-Up
- 9. Plaza Bulb Replacement
- 10. Grade Parking Lots & Driveways
- 11. Receive Work Orders/Phone Calls/Radio Calls
- 12. Data Entry
- 13. Brick Paver Maint.
- 14. Separate and Prioritize Work Orders
- 15. Landscape Move Bleachers
- 16. Scheduling
- 17. Job Inspection
- 18. Pre-Start Job Inspection
- 19. Return Phone Calls
- 20. Oversee Job Progress
- 21. Inspect Completed Jobs
- 22. Fill-In For Skilled Workers

- 23. Project Management
- 24. Communications
- 25. Newsletter

## **GRADED F**

- 1. Equipment Maintenance
- 2. P.M. Painting
- 3. P.M. Electrical
- 4. P.M. Plumbing
- 5. Haul Bleachers and Picnic Tables, Set-Ups
- 6. Supply Ordering/Delivering
- 7. Oversee Job Progress
- 8. File Paperwork
- 9. Inspect Plots/Parks For Safety
- 10. Performance Appraisal
- 11. Training Employees (OJT)
- 12. Receive Salesmen
- 13. Mgmt. Staffing

## APPENDIX D

## MANAGEMENT GROUP

## TOP THREE ITEMS

## **ORGANIZATION**

Better Communication
Better Cooperation - Team Work
Organization Development/Structure
Redistribute Workload
New Location Centralized

## **FINANCE**

Improve Budget Process

## **OPERATIONS**

Improve Delivery System Resources to Support Prof. Office (Staff, MIS system, Etc.) Computerized Work Order Management System

## **SAFETY**

0

## **PERSONNEL**

Do positions and salary match the job assigned and performed

## **TRAINING**

More and better training

- 19. Miscellaneous Requests
- 20. Hauling Junk/Trash
- 21. State of the Trees Report
- 22. Relations with Contractors
- 23. Relations with Professionals
- 24. Coordination with other city agencies, esp. Public Works
- 25. Personnel Administration -- Performance Evaluation Effort
- 26. Hiring

## GRADED C

- 1. Grass Mowing -- Low Priority
- 2. Bldg. Maint. -- Problem with Preventative Maint.; Age of Buildings; Develop Check Off
  - System; Problem with Closing Buildings to do work.
- 3. Janitorial Services--Looking to Privatize-Pilot Project, Consolidate Like Functions
- 4. Ballfield Rehab--3 Year Cycle; More Resources; Tarps
- 5. Plumbing Maintenance/Construction Contracted
- 6. Electrical Maintenance/Construction
- 7. 600 to 800 Service Requests per year to remove "public" trees that have fallen on private property -- second crew on contract; slowly moving up; time
- 8. Tree Pruning Reactive Basis
- 9. Tennis Court Maint. 100-110 Counts; Courts need repaved; 5 year plan to cover-not funded? Preventative maintenance a problem
- 10. Tree Ordinance Permits Education/Evaluation-Council and Mayor and Inspections; Elected official input/support needed; no coordination with other city departments
- Day to Day Administration (Need historic information, data/mgmt. information system; too much compartmentalization-teamwork questioned/need analysts
- 12. Personnel Admin. -- System
- 13. Personnel Admin. -- Pay Plan
- 14. Personnel Admin. -- Communications

## GRADED D

- 1. Parks & Maint. (Enhance Communication)
- 2. Personnel Admin. -- Pay Plan

## **GRADED F**

1. Liaison with Schools -- Higher Level Involvement Needed

# APPENDIX E

## SERVICES & GRADES COMPARISON

SPECIFIC FUNCTIONS	C	GRADES GIVEN B	Y:	
	SUPERVISORS	EMPLOYEES	RECREATION	MGMT.
ADA - Conversion to Meet			C	
Administration - Day-to-Day				C-
Animals (Caring For)	В			
Appliances - Clean & Repair		A	***	
Aquarium - Maintain Stream		B-		
Area Beautification Comm Adopt Spot/Gateway Program				В
Auditorium & Tivoli Assist.				A
Backboards - Clean		A		
Ballfield Maintenance	A		D	A
Ballfields - Catch Basin		C+		
Ballfields - Construction	С		F	
Ballfields - Dragging/Lining	A	B/A		B+
Ballfields - Fencing			A	
Ballfields - Grading	В			
Ballfields - Handle/Pickup		B-		
Ballfields - Lighting				B+
Ballfields - Mowing		A-		
Ballfields - Reseeding/Rehab		A		С
Bids - Preventive		A		
Bleachers/Picnic Tables - Haul	D/F	F		
Brick Paver Maintenance	D			
Bridge Maintenance (Inspect)		A		
Brush Clean-up/Removal	С			
Budget (Create)	С	<u> </u>		
Build Containment Areas for Playgrounds and Flower Beds	D			

SPECIFIC FUNCTIONS		GRADES GIVEN B	Y:	
	SUPERVISORS	EMPLOYEES	RECREATION	MGMT.
Build Pavilions	В			
Building Inspection/ Maint.		F		C+
Bulbs -Change Florescent		D		
Bulbs - Change Non- Florescent		A		
Cabinetry/Furniture Construction		A	F	
Carpentry Construction & Repair	С	D	F	В
Carpentry - Emergency	В			
Clean Crews/Cleans 8 Centers		В		C+
Clean-up - Emergency	В			
Clean-up Equipment	В			
Clean-up - Litter Removal	A			
Communications	D	С		D
Community Groups-Liaison				В
Concrete		A		
Conference Planning				A-
Construction (New)	В			
Contractors - Work With		D		В
County Projects - Joint				B+/A
Data Entry	D			
Demolition	В			
Design Consultation			В	
Driveways & Parking Lots (Grading of)	D		D	
Electrical (Emergency)	B+			

SPECIFIC FUNCTIONS	G	RADES GIVEN BY	Y:	
	SUPERVISORS	EMPLOYEES	RECREATION	MGMT.
Electrical Maintenance	•		В	С
Electrical (P.M.)	F			
Electrician		A		
Emergency Repairs/Services	A		B+	
Equipment - Inspect & Service	В			
Equipment Maintenance & Needed Equipment	F	A		
Equipment Operator for Other Departments	С			
Facility Inspection - Inside			F	
Fence - Building/Replacing/ Temporary Use	С	В		
Fence Lines		D		
Fence Repair	D	D		
Fertilize	A	A		
File Paperwork	F			
Fill-in for Skilled Workers	D			
Flag Replacement	A/B			
Floors - Mop all Non-Carpeted		A/B/C		
Floors - Strip		A		
Flower Beds (Construction/More Needed)	В	В		
Flower Beds (Design)	В			
Flowers/Shrubs (Fertilize)	A			
Flowers	A			B+
Fountain & Stream Maintenance	D	В		
Front Fountain Maintenance		A		

SPECIFIC FUNCTIONS		GRADES GIVEN B	Y;	
	SUPERVISORS	EMPLOYEES	RECREATION	MGMT.
Funding	С			
Garbage Collection	D	D	A/C	
Garbage and Recycling to Curb		A/C		
General Maintenance		D-		
Get Crew Together		С		
Grass - "Handwork"/Cut/Trim/ Weedeat	В	A-/A	В	
Grass - Lay Sod		С		
Greater Chattanooga Sports Committee Tournaments				A
Greenhouse		A		B+
Greenhouse - Repair	В			
Greenhouse - Work at		С		
Greenways - Interfacing w/ Coordinator and Boards				В
Ground Cover			D	
Gym/Ceramic Room-Clean		C-		
Gym Floors (Stripping)	A-			
Heating & Air Conditioning	A	B+	В	A
Heating & Air Cond. (Emergency)	В			
Heating & Air Cond. (P.M.)	C/D			
Heavy Equipment Check (P.M.)	A			
Housing Authority Facilities - Cleaning (No Agreement)			F	
Infields - Construct and Rebuild		C/B		

SPECIFIC FUNCTIONS	GRADES GIVEN BY:			
	SUPERVISORS	EMPLOYEES	RECREATION	MGMT
Inspect Completed Jobs	D			
Interview and Hire	С			
Irrigation Operation	В	C/B		
Irrigation Repair	С			
Job Inspection (include prestart)	B/D			
Job Site (Meet and Greet Public)	B/C			į
Krystal Farm Project				A+
Landscaping Activities - Deal with Homeless		A+		
Landscaping - Advice to the Public	В			
Landscaping - Cutting, Planting, and Pruning Trees	В	B/A	F	В
Landscaping - Move Bleachers	D			
Leaves - Rake/Blow Walkways		C/B		
Lessee's Marina/Warner Park Concessions - Liaison				В
Lights - Replace			F	
Mail		A		
Management Staffing	F			
Masonry Work			A	
Materials Pick-upNeed for Warehouse, Deliver	B/C	F		
Meetings/Special Interest Groups (Attend)	В			В
Miller Park (Maintenance)	В			

SPECIFIC FUNCTIONS	GRADES GIVEN BY:			
	SUPERVISORS	EMPLOYEES	RECREATION	MGMT
Miscellaneous Requests				B+
Mow/Maintain Outside		A/F/D/B/C		B/C-
Mowers - Repair		D		
Mulching - Flower Beds, Etc.	С	B/A		
Newsletter	D			
Odd JobsHaul Dirt, Mulch		С		
Office - Clean		В		
Oversee Job Progress	B/D/F			
Painting (Emergency)	С			
Painting/Graffiti Removal			С	
Painting - Maint. Indoor/Outdoor		С		
Painting (New Construction)	A			
Painting (P.M.)	F			
Park Vehicles (Use of)			С	
Parking Lots (Build)	В			
Payroll		A		
Performance Appraisal	F			
Personnel Administration - Performance Evaluation (Effort & System)				В/С
Personnel Administration - Pay Plan				C/D
Personnel Administration - Hiring				В-
Personnel Administration - Communications				С
Phone - Answer		A		

SPECIFIC FUNCTIONS		GRADES GIVEN BY	Y:	
	SUPERVISORS	EMPLOYEES	RECREATION	MGMT
Phone Calls - Returned	D			
Playground Equipment (Maintenance & Inspection)		F/B	F	
Playground Equipment (Mulching)	С			
Playground Equipment (Repair)			D	
Plaza - "Billy Goat"		С		
Plaza - Bulb Replacement	D			
Plaza - Fertilizing	В			
Plaza - Landscaping, Plant Replacement	A	A		
Plaza - Litter/Trash Removal	B/C	A		
Plaza - Maintenance of Riverwalks and Other Joint Funded Projects				A
Plaza - Minor Equipment Repair (P.M.)	В			
Plaza - Mowing	В	A		
Plaza - Pruning	В	С		
Plaza - Sweeping		A		
Plots (Maint. for 26)	В	С		
Plots - Rake		A		
Plots/Parks - Inspect for Safety	F			
Plumbing (Emergency)	A			
Plumbing (New Construction)	Α			C+
Plumbing (P.M.)	Α	-		
Plumbing (Winterization)	В			

SPECIFIC FUNCTIONS	GRADES GIVEN BY:			
	SUPERVISORS	EMPLOYEES	RECREATION	MGMT
Plumbing for 65 Facilities/Repair		В-/В		
Power House/Warner Park		A-		
Professionals - Relations				В
Project Management	D			
Pump Maintenance/Contract				В
Receive Salesmen	F			
Recreation - Informal and Formal Relationship				В
Recreation Centers in Summer			D	
Recreation Centers - Cleaning Facilities Daily			C-	
Recreation Centers - Repairing Facilities			С	
Recreation Centers - Set-up Work				В
Refrigerator Levels - Check		A		
Reseeding	A			
Restrooms - Clean/Custodial	A	A/D		
Restrooms at Greenway - Clean		A		
Riverboat - Liaison				Α
Road Repair - Gravel		F		
Roof Repair		D		
Rose Garden Spraying		A		
Roses - Planting/Garden		A		A
Ross's Landing - Chemical Spraying		F		

SPECIFIC FUNCTIONS		RADES GIVEN B	Y:	
	SUPERVISORS	EMPLOYEES	RECREATION	MGMT.
Ross's Landing - Garbage Collection		В		
Safety Conscious for Crew	C			
Safety Meetings (Attend)	A			
Safety Training	С			
Scheduling	D	:		A
Schools - Liaison				A/F
Security (Locks)			D-	
Senior Games - Local and State Support				A
Service/Coordination with Other Departments				A-/B+
Set-up (Special Events)		С	С	B+
Shrubs - Planting/Replacing	A	В		
Shrubs - Pruning/Trimming		B/D		
Sidewalks - Construction			В	-
Signage			В	
Site Preparation	С			-
Soil Test	A			
Storm Drain		С		
Summer Food Program		F		
Supplies - Games			F	
Supplies- Order/Deliver/Provide	F	D/B	F	
Survey Work	В			
Sweeping/Push Dust Mop		A		
Swimming Pool - Certified Operator		B-		

SPECIFIC FUNCTIONS	GRADES GIVEN BY:			
	SUPERVISORS	EMPLOYEES	RECREATION	MGMT
Swimming Pools - Maintenance		A	A	
Take Sick Calls - 8 A.M. ??	A/B			
Tennis Courts - Maintenance	D	D		C+
Tractor Driver		В		
Traffic - Direct		A		
Training Employees (OJT)	F			
Trash/Junk/Brush Collection		C/B-	F	
Trash Hauling	A/B	C/C-		B+
Trash & Litter Hauling - Warner/Montague	В			
Tree Advisory/Commission	A			A
Tree Bracing	В			
Tree City, U.S.A.				A
Tree Cutting (Emergency)	В		-	
Tree Equipment Inspection	В			
Tree Maintenance			В	-
Tree Ordinance Permits				C-
Tree Planting	A/B	B-/A-		B+
Tree Pruning	С	C/D		C+
Tree Removal-Contractual; Storms	B/C-	A		C-
Trees - Inspect Requests	A			
Trees - State Report				B+
Trees (Transport Alive)	A			
Trees/Shrubs (Water)	В			

SPECIFIC FUNCTIONS	C	GRADES GIVEN B	Y:	
	SUPERVISORS	EMPLOYEES	RECREATION	MGMT.
Truck Driver- Construction/Drive Truck Daily		A/F		
Urban Forestry-Grant Mgmt.				A
Urban Forestry-Long Term Planning Division				A
Vacant Lots (Clearing)	С			
Vacuum		A/C		
Vermin Control (On-call)			С	
Water Wall Jets - Clean		В		
Welding (Emergency)	A			
Welding (New Construction)- Handrails, Assist.	В	A		,
Windows/Mirrors - Washing	B-	A		
Work Orders - Issue	С			
Work Orders - Receive/Phone Calls/Radio Calls	D			
Work Orders - Separate and Prioritize	D			
Write Reports	С			
Write Specs Follow-up/Bid Openings	С			
Zoo Grounds	B+			
Zoo Outreach Programs	A			